

Exhibit 3

4 Civil Action No.
5 In re: FLINT WATER CASES 5:16-cv-10444-JEL-MKM
6 (consolidated)
Hon. Judith E. Levy
----- Mag. Mona K. Majzoub

8 STATE OF MICHIGAN
IN THE CIRCUIT COURT FOR THE COUNTY OF GENESEE

10 IN RE FLINT WATER Case No. 17-1086460-NO
LITIGATION Hon. Richard B. Yuille

JENNIFER MASON, et al. Case No. 16-106150-NM
13 Hon. Richard B. Yuille

Plaintiffs,

V.

LOCKWOOD, ANDREWS & NEWNAM,
16 PC. et al..

17 Defendants. HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

18 -----X

19 VIDEOTAPED DEPOSITION OF JONATHAN CARPENTER

20 Monday, December 16, 2019, 9:09 a.m.

21 Washington, DC 20005

22 Reported by: Denise Dobner Vickery, RMR, CRR

23 GOLKOW LITIGATION SERVICES

T 877.370.3377 | F 917.591.5672

24 deps@golkow.com

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10 Videotaped Deposition of JONATHAN
11 CARPENTER, held at the offices of:

13 COHEN MILSTEIN SELLERS & TOLL PLLC
14 1100 New York Avenue NW
15 Suite 500, West Tower
16 Washington, DC 20005

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

Golkow Litigation Services

Page 2

1 APPEARANCES:

2

3 On Behalf of Executive Committee for Class
Plaintiffs:

4

EMMY L. LEVENS, ESQ.

5 COHEN MILSTEIN

6 1100 New York Avenue NW, Fifth Floor

7 Washington, DC 20005

elevens@cohenmilstein.com

8 202.408.4600

9 On Behalf of Individual Plaintiffs:

10 ALASTAIR J.M. FINDEIS, ESQ.

11 NAPOLI SHKOLNIK PLLC

12 400 Broadhollow Road, Suite 305

Melville, NY 11747

13 afindeis@napolilaw.com

14 202.408.4600

15

16 On Behalf of Mason State Court Plaintiffs
(via videoconference):

17 JAYSON E. BLAKE, ESQ.

18 MCALPINE PC

19 3201 University Drive, Suite 200

20 Auburn Hills, MI 48326

21 jeblake@mcalpinepc.com

22 248.373.3700

23

24 On Behalf of the People of the State of Michigan:

25

26 NATHAN GAMBILL, ASSISTANT ATTORNEY
27 GENERAL

28 MICHIGAN DEPARTMENT OF ATTORNEY GENERAL

29 525 West Ottawa Street, Sixth Floor

30 Lansing, MI 48909

31 gambilln@michigan.gov

32 517.335.7664

33

34

35

1 APPEARANCES: (Continued)
2

3 On Behalf of Defendants Veolia Water North
4 America Operating Services, LLC, Veolia North
5 America, LLC, Veolia North America, Inc., and the
Witness:
6

7 BRYAN D. MCELVAINE, ESQ.
8 KRISTIN M. DUPRE, ESQ.
9 CAMPBELL CONROY & O'NEIL PC
10 1205 Westlakes Drive, Suite 330
Berwyn, PA 19312
bmcelvaine@campbell-trial-lawyers.com
kdupre@campbell-trial-lawyers.com
610.964.6381

11 On Behalf of Defendant City of Flint
(via videoconference):
12

13 SHELDON H. KLEIN, ESQ.
14 BUTZEL LONG
15 41000 Woodward Avenue
Bloomfield Hills, MI 48304
kleins@butzel.com
248.258.1616

16 On Behalf of Defendants Leo A. Daly Company and
Lockwood, Andrews & Newnam, Inc.:
17

18 DAVID KENT, ESQ.
19 DRINKER BIDDLE & REATH LLP
20 1717 Main Street, Suite 5400
Dallas, TX 75201-7367
david.kent@dbr.com
469.357.2535

21 On Behalf of Defendants MDEQ Executive Defendants
(via videoconference):
22

23 CHRISTOPHER B. CLARE, ESQ.
CLARK HILL PLC
1001 Pennsylvania Avenue NW,
Suite 1300 South
Washington, DC 20004
cclare@clarkhill.com
202.572.8671

1 APPEARANCES: (Continued)

2

3 On Behalf of Defendant Stephen Busch
(via videoconference):

4

TYLER J. ANDERSON, ESQ.

5 SMITH HAUGHEY RICE & ROEGGE

100 Monroe Center NW

6 Grand Rapids, MI 49503

tanderson@shrr.com

7 616.458.3412

8 On Behalf of Defendant McLaren Regional Medical
Center (via teleconference):

9

MEGAN R. MULDER, ESQ.

10 CLINE, CLINE & GRIFFIN, PC

Mott Foundation Building

11 503 S. Saginaw Street, Suite 1000

Flint, MI 48502

12 www.ccglawyers.com

800.837.1973

13

14 ALSO PRESENT:

15 CHRISTOPHER FLETCHER, ESQ. (via videoconference)

FRANCIS FERRARA, ESQ. (via videoconference)

16 JOSEPH FURTON, ESQ. (via videoconference)

17

18 VIDEOGRAPHER: Daniel Holmstock

19

20

21

22

23

24

1 A. Correct.

2 Q. The last line here says:

3 "We should submit proposal to enter
4 utility to upsale."

5 Do you see that, sir?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. What did you mean by that sentence?

8 A. Again, as I've explained previously,
9 whenever we go after a job, you also always talk
10 to the customer to see if there's any opportunity
11 for any other needs that they may have and see if
12 there's anything that you can provide
13 additionally.

14 Q. To grow the contract; correct?

15 A. To grow business. To grow business.

16 Q. To grow business?

17 A. To grow business.

18 Q. To make money for VNA?

19 A. Yes, that's what my job is to be a
20 salesperson and find opportunities.

21 Q. And why would you need to enter the
22 utility to upsale?

23 A. Well, I -- you don't know what you
24 have or what the problems are until you talk to

1 the customer and find out what their needs are, as
2 I've said, and the only way you do that is to talk
3 to the customer, learn about the utility, learn
4 what their needs are. And if they say these are
5 things that they need help with and if you can
6 provide those things, then that's what you do.
7 You give them a proposal to provide assistance
8 with their needs, and that's how you grow the
9 business.

10 Q. So would it be fair to say that
11 access to the utility would provide information
12 making it easier to upsell the contract?

13 MR. McELVAINE: Objection.

14 You can answer.

15 THE WITNESS: Yes.

16 BY MS. LEVENS:

17 Q. Is that why VNA would have agreed to
18 accept a study like the one it did for the City of
19 Flint?

20 MR. McELVAINE: Objection.

21 You can answer.

22 THE WITNESS: There's always an
23 opportunity for upsell. That's what we look
24 for as salespeople. In terms of what VNA as a